



Never doubt that a small group of thoughtful, committed citizens can change the world. Indeed, it's the only thing that ever has.

—Margaret Mead

SHEHRI

Jan-June, 2007 Vol. 18/No. 1

INSIDE

- Citizen Report Card
- Shehri Seminars
- Shehri AGM
- LBOD Crisis
- Coastal Development

WATER SECTOR IN KARACHI PLANNING AHEAD

Farhan Anwar highlights the issues and concerns related with the water sector in Karachi and suggests recommendations for service improvement and institutional reforms.

KW&SB, the main formal service delivery institution, faces a crisis rooted in a lack of accountability, transparency and operational autonomy, legal ambiguities, a dysfunctional governance structure, technical inadequacy, tariff imbalances and financial bankruptcy. Following are discussed some relevant issues that would help define the current situation in the sector.

Water supply and sanitation service delivery levels in Karachi are very poor with serious economic and social costs to the city and the citizens. Households connected to the KW&SB network in Karachi receive water only for three (3) to four (4) hours per day. Intermittent water supply

has severe public health consequences, as clean water in pipelines becomes contaminated in the absence of sustained water pressure. High levels of leakages/water theft (30%) in the network make contamination more severe.

About 70% of the water supplied to the city returns as sewage. A total quantity of 315 mgd of domestic and toxic industrial wastewater is generated in the city. There are three sewage treatment plants in Karachi. The combined design capacity of these treatment plants is 151 mgd. The untreated sewage is disposed off in sea through nallahs, including the Lyari River. The total length of sewers is 3,500 miles and ranges from 8" to 66" diameter of trunk sewers, sec-



Discharge of untreated sewage on the Clifton beach

History of Institutional Development

1953: Karachi Joint Water Board (KJWB) constituted. One of its major tasks was to expand the water supply from the Indus river source.

1981: Karachi Water Management Board (KWMB) was formed. It was responsible for water supply to the entire metropolitan area of Karachi as well as cost recovery.

1983: Karachi Water and Sewerage Board (KW&SB) was formed. It was comprehensively responsible for the water supply and sewerage services within the Karachi Metropolitan Area.

1996: Karachi Water and Sewerage Board Act was passed by the Sindh Assembly. According to the Act, the KW&SB was separated from KMC.

2003: KW&SB operationally merged into City District Government of Karachi (CDGK) under the Sindh Local Government Ordinance 2001. It was termed as Water and Sanitation Department (WSD). Internal organization largely remained unchanged.

Source: KW&SB



SHEHRI

206-G Block 2, P.E.C.H.S.,
Karachi-75400, Pakistan
Tel/Fax: 92-21-453-0646
e-mail/address:
shehri @ onkhura.com
(web site)
www.shehri.org

EDITOR

Farhan Anwar

MANAGING COMMITTEE

Chairperson : Roland deSouza

Vice Chairperson :

Dr. S. Raza Ali Gardezi

General Secretary :

Amber Ali Bhai

Treasurer :

Sheikh Rizwan Abdullah

Members : Khalid Ahmed

Hanif Sattar

Derrick Dean

SHEHRI STAFF

Co-ordinator :

Sarwar Khalid

Asst. Co-ordinator :

Mohammad

Rehan Ashraf

SHEHRI Founding Members

1. Mr. Khalid Nadvi (*Economist*)
2. Barrister Qazi Faez Isa
3. Ms. Humaira Rehman (*Architect*)
4. Mr. Danish Azar Zubay (*Architect*)
5. Mr. Navaid Husain (*Architect*)
6. Barrister Zain Sheikh
7. Dr. Kaiser Bengali (*Economist*)

Contributions are welcome

Interested contributors should contact the SHEHRI office for writers guidelines. SHEHRI newsletter readership is from students, professionals, environmentalists, policy makers, NGOs and other organizations.

Views expressed herein do not necessarily express the views of the Editor/Editorial Board.

Composed by : Printed by :

Shah Graphics Samina Printers
Tel : 660 88 22

For the printing of this newsletter

SHEHRI-CBE

acknowledges the support of
The Friedrich-Naumann
Foundation

SHEHRI-CBE

acknowledges the support of
The Friedrich-Naumann
Foundation

Member of

IUCN

The World Conservation Union

EDITORIAL

One for all and all for one!

A Supreme Court Bench comprising Justices Rana Bhagwandas and Mohammad Nawaz Abbasi has set court in the Supreme Court Registry in Karachi to see what the Honorable Supreme Court can do to sort out the ever escalating traffic chaos in Karachi. Rather than coming up with any concrete solutions, the Court proceedings have unfortunately to date witnessed allegations and counter allegations between the various authorities tasked with managing Karachi.

While some of the allegations being hurled at each other by all concerned may not be totally without merit, these court proceedings and the debates ensuing around them have yet again brought to the fore the regrettable and unfortunate fact that Karachi lacks an appropriate and coordinated management control system. While it is clichéd to say that 'Karachi is owned and managed by over 20 federal, provincial, local and private entities having their own set of rules, regulations and management controls' - this is where the crux of the problem lies.

If we take the case of the transport crisis, then it is not something that only has to do with lack of parking space, lack of proper public transport, encroachments, instead the crisis is sourced from and rooted in the way the overall growth and development dynamics of the city is mapping out. Land use and zoning rules and regulations are flouted with impunity, with the result that there can now be termed few areas and

localities in the city that are purely 'residential' or 'purely commercial'. This merging and mixing of land uses gives rise to chaotic and unpredictable traffic patterns that defy the application of standard traffic planning and management practices to resolve the crisis. Traffic is moving in all directions at all times without a discernable or identifiable ebb or flow in the traffic load.

In the absence of a functioning 'Master Plan' or an overriding umbrella management control, ad-hocism has taken firm roots and all concerned are busy fighting the fire rather than doing anything to prevent it. Projects undertaken are not part of a holistic planning process and rather than having a city wide planning focus they are geared to relieving site specific traffic stresses.

This strategy may offer short term gains but can never be a substitute to a set of integrated projects being identified as a result of a city wide transport planning exercise. Long term, holistic and integrated planning cannot take place unless we have a coordinated management control system. If the city is to survive as a viable organic whole the all have to pull together.

If Karachi has to have any hope of being placed in the category of a developed, prosperous and viable mega city of the world then all concerned have to show the will and the action to do the needful. Are we all not on the same boat? □



ondary sewers and laterals.

In the absence of proper network at places sewage has been diverted to storm water drains, Lyari/Malir Rivers, Gujru Nallah, Orangi Nallah and other tributaries. There are a large number of Katchi Abadis where more than 40% of the city's population lives. The population of the city for which the system was originally designed has exceeded the design capacity. Consequently the sewerage network is overloaded and is rendered undersized in a number of areas.

In case of municipal waste water treatment, the three sewage treatment plants are functioning at 20-30% efficiency, mainly because the majority of the sewer pipes, secondary/trunk sewers are not connected to the plants with the result that hydraulic loading is insufficient. Lack of trained staff employed for operating the plants and meeting the requirements of fulfilling the O/M procedures/practices and crisis management is another inhibiting factor. Insufficient financial resources hinder proper maintenance and upgrading of the plants

KW&SB investments in the past have mostly augmented production and transmission, neglecting efficiency improvements, rehabilitation and maintenance. Networks and facilities have therefore deteriorated, inefficiencies and losses have made operations wasteful and financial capacity constraints have prevented investment planning based on an integrated view of capital expenditures, operation and maintenance and least cost principles.

Absence of a systematic policy or regulatory framework makes it difficult to hold KW&SB accountable for its performance. KW&SB is still managed in terms

Sydney Water Plan - The Main Concept Learning from International Best Practices

The Sydney Water Plan has materialized in recognition of the fact that the city is using more water than is sustainable. The Plan has therefore been developed to ensure that the people of the greater Sydney area have enough water to meet their needs over the next 25 years. The main concept behind the Plan is to maximize the availability of water by optimizing on a mix of options rather than relying on a single option. For example, the Plan, while outlining plans and strategies for augmenting water supply, also focuses strongly on identifying measures to reduce demand by bringing down consumption levels and encouraging water conservation practices. So the overall strategy is to determine the timing and sequencing of the options (such as supply, save or substitute water) to deliver the best social, economic and environmental outcomes for the community

Summary of Plan Proposals

The Plan focuses on the following key aspects:

- Minimize the risk of water shortages by diversifying sources of supply
- Ensure secure water supplies
- Protect and restore river health
- Adopt a partnership approach with the community
- Provide good quality, cost effective water supply services
- Foster innovation
- Increase the efficient use of water
- Match the grade of water to its end use
- Optimize the use of existing infrastructure
- Appropriately target future investment
- Make decisions adaptively
- Ensure actions are acceptable to the public, affordable, feasible and sustainable

Analysis of the Plan

The following analysis looks critically into the planning methodologies of the Sydney Water Plan:

Goal Setting

The goal setting for this project is sound and comprehensive as it is backed both by the relevant political quarters and is supported by an in-depth analytical review of the existing situation. The fact that the Plan enjoys wide political support is reflected in the due importance accorded to all the available range of options and in that the government is taking the lead in the implementation of water conservation measures. The Plan also appears to enjoy the support of important stakeholders such as industry as strong measures are advocated for their contribution in the sustainable use and demand management of the water resources. An aggressive public participation component also reflects

Cont. Pg 4



of the KW&SB Act of 1996, but it also functions under the conditions of the Sindh Local Government Ordinance (SLGO) of 2001, which has marked implications for its place within the broader devolution process and its relative relationships with the provincial, city and town level governments in its area of jurisdiction. The KW&SB Act of 1996 provides for a Governing Board that has barely met over the past few years.

KW&SB has limited control over influencing tariff re-adjustment and there is no independent regulation of tariffs. In the absence of an effective tariff structure and a process of tariff setting that considers economically rational operational factors, there has been no incentive for greater efficiency or for customers to pay. KW&SB's relationship with consumers also needs much improvement in order to mobilize public support for action against illegal connections, encroachment of pipelines and other malpractices that undermine operations.

Nearly 30 MGD of water is being provided to industrial sites located at S.I.T.E, Korangi, Landhi, F.B Area, North Karachi and elsewhere in the city. However, none of the industrial estates in Karachi are served with effluent collection and conveyance system. So the effluents are not collected and conveyed to the KW&SB treatment plants and instead are discharged mostly untreated into the sea via the Malir and Lyari Rivers.

Some industries do employ in-house waste water treatment practices but their effluents are not treated in the KW&SB treatment plants. About 70% of the total industry of Pakistan is located in Karachi. Most of the Industry is located in Sindh Industrial Trading Estate (S.I.T.E), Landhi Industrial Trading Estate (L.I.T.E), Korangi

Industrial Area, West Wharf Industrial Area and the Hub Industrial Trading Estate (H.I.T.E).

International Best Practices

The reforms in the public utilities recently carried out in Johannesburg, South Africa, Phnom Penh, Cambodia, Manila, Philippines and Uganda offer a range of options that have worked and can serve as reference points for selecting the most viable reform options for Karachi.

Recommendations

Following are discussed some short, medium and long term measures to reform the water and sanitation sector in Karachi:

Short term Measures - Timeframe (6-12 months)

Profiling the Water & Sanitation Sector

To tackle the serious and deep rooted institutional defects, mobilization and support for change is desirable not only within the institutions itself but amongst the widest possible range of stakeholders.

Building mutual understanding in a heavily contested institutional environment is always a difficult and risky process. As a first step, documenting the defacto situation in regards to 'who has access to what services' and identifying 'who plays what roles' can be a very useful step in promoting the understanding of 'why certain stakeholders behave in the way that they do'. For instance, the local communities have done remarkable work in improving the water and sanitation infrastructure in the informal settlements. However the problem of harmonizing these systems within a network must be recognized. At the same time, the significant con-

citizen input and involvement in the goal setting process.

Strategic Framework

The level of technological advancement and sophistication achieved in the Australian society is fully reflected in the proposals put forward in this plan. Highly advanced plans for water conservation, recycling, reuse, land use management that have been identified in the Plan can only be applicable in society that enjoys a high quality of living. This strategic edge provides a holistic and integrated outlook to the plan. Whereas adequate consideration is being given to supply augmentation measures, an extremely ambitious and aggressive plan for curbing demand by encouraging and facilitating water conservation practices for the community, government and industry is being outlined.

While standard practices are being followed, new and innovative strategies such as accessing deep water at the bottom of dams to increase water availability are also being proposed. A significant aspect of the Plan is its long term approach. It is a balancing act between having enough water in the short term and ensuring that water resources are managed sustainably in the long term. In this regard, ensuring the environmental health of the river bodies is given priority consideration.

The forward thought process is suggested in another critical aspect of water management - Conflict Resolution. The Plan accommodates measures for resolving potential conflicts between different categories of consumers by proposing to develop a water sharing plan. The water sharing plan would identify measures for securing the share of water available for urban and rural consumption as well as protect the new environmental flow regimes - **FA**



Illegal extraction of water - A sector in crisis

tribution of KW&SB in developing bulk water and wastewater resources must be recognized, especially in the context of the genuine constraints under which the organization operates. Similarly, the role of local government representatives in representing their constituency and the associated roles assigned and executed by the different tiers of local government needs to be given due priority. The general thrust of such an assessment being to move from the reality, to the incentives that lie behind this reality - that sustain the current status quo. Without a viable governance framework that identifies the appropriate roles and responsibilities of relevant stakeholders in policy making, service delivery and regulation, the long term effects of technical, financial or internal management changes cannot be secured.

A number of studies are presently being undertaken by a number of organizations such as ADB, JICA, WSP etc. however none of the study is proposing generation of primary data on the sector and are instead relying on secondary data, much of which is outdated and at times also lacks authenticity. It is therefore proposed to conduct a comprehensive exercise of primary data collection for the entire sector, whether formally or informally managed in terms of infrastructure development, financial contributions, legal and policy issues etc. Such data to then feed into the future planning and development initiatives that would need to be undertaken in Karachi.

Medium Term Measures - Timeframe (2-4 years)

Institutional Reforms

Sustainable service delivery improvements are not achievable unless technical and financial inputs are driven by effective and accountable institutions - clearly accountable to legitimate political authority and consumers, and with full responsibility for operational management. The water and sanitation sector in Karachi is faced with a crisis situation. The goal within the broader context should be to reform the water and sanitation sector in terms of ensuring the institutional and financial viability of the sector and enhancing customer orientation and accountability and therefore improve the quality of life of the people.

Recently, the KW&SB management has initiated a series of reforms in areas such as revenue and operational management and improving customer services. Though highly welcome, in order to have lasting and holistic impact, it is felt that these reforms have to be embedded within a sector based reform process that targets broad based institutional reforms and the related issues of governance. A viable reform initiative would have to be based on the following important considerations:

- * Achieving political commitment
- * Building mutual understanding in a heavily contested institutional environment
- * Identification of approaches for maximizing the capacity of all contributing stakeholders
- * Ensuring the sustainability of actions

It is therefore suggested that any efforts aimed at institutional reforms should be encouraged and facilitated. Appropriate fiscal support would have

to be made available for supporting the reform process.

Long Term Measures - Timeframe (5-10 years)

Following the process of institutional reforms and strengthening, the following long term plans/projects are being identified for implementation:

- * Integrated Coastal Zone Management (ICZM) Plan/ Implementation for Karachi
- * Rehabilitating Karachi's Waterways: Lyari/Malir River Basin Management/Planning and Implementation
- * A Drainage Plan
- * City Wide Sewer System/ Network Rehabilitation

Industrial Sector Initiatives

Some separate recommendations are being made for the industrial sector:

For the industrial sector, the following measures are being identified for implementation:

- * Investment be directed at providing the industrial estates with proper sewerage/drainage infrastructure and an effective management system (proper collaboration b/w the industry/KW&SB-CDGK)
- * Provision of financial incentives for the industrial sector to promote the installation of waste water treatment facilities
- * Investment in the development of indigenous waste water technologies/systems of waste water treatment (e.g. industry-university liaison, capacity building of local consultants/contractors/manufacturers). □

Farhan Anwar is an Urban Planner and Editor, Shehri Newsletter



SHEHRI ACTIVITIES

Shehri seminar on Corporate Social Responsibility December 02, 2007 (Hotel Marriott, Karachi)

Shehri-CBE in collaboration with Sustainable Initiatives held a 'Multi-stakeholder Orientation Workshop' - The OECD Guidelines for Multinational Enterprises: An Instrument for Implementing CSR', at Hotel Marriott, Karachi on Saturday, December 02, 2006, as part of the project, 'Civil Society Capacity Building on Corporate Social Responsibility and OECD Guidelines Implementation Procedures'.

The welcome address was given by Ms. Amber Alibhai, General Secretary Shehri-CBE while the objectives and methodology of the workshop were elaborated upon by Mr. Farhan Anwar, Executive Director, Sustainable Initiatives.

The first presentation 'Intro on the OECD Guidelines and aims/history of OECD Watch and its activities', was made by Peter Pennartz, IRENE International Restructuring Education Network Europe in collaboration with Center for Research on Multinational Enterprises (SOMO), The Netherlands. Mr. Pennartz identified the role and mandate of the OECD Watch and identified the background of the global corporate accountability movement. He said that the importance of the Guidelines covering a broad range of issues such as labor, environment, human rights, corruption, taxation etc. is indicated in the

fact that they represent an internationally accepted frame of reference for CSR, by business, trade unions and to some extent, the NGO's.

The second presentation 'Corporate Social Responsibility, the OECD Guidelines and the Pakistani Context', was jointly presented by Farhan Anwar and Seema Khurram of Sustainable Initiatives. Mr. Anwar presented the first component where an analysis was made of the sections of the Guidelines dealing with the environment to the key environmental legislative instrument that is enforced in Pakistan and that provides a broad framework for environmental regulation and enforcement, namely the Pakistan Environmental Protection Act 1997 and its related rules, regulations and enforcement mechanism. In the second component, Seema Khurram shared with the participants the analytical results of a survey that Sustainable Initiatives had earlier conducted on assessing the potential role citizen groups in Pakistan can play in facilitating corporate compliance.

The third presentation 'Damaging the environment and livelihoods: BP oil exploration activities in Badin', was made by Dr. Akash Ansari of the Badin Rural Development Society. The presentation dealt with the environmental degradation that has taken place in the Badin area of the province

of Sindh due to the oil exploration activities being undertaken by BP Pakistan.

The fourth presentation 'Left Bank Outfall Drain (LBOD) Project - Spelling Environmental and Social Disaster' was made by a noted citizen activist, Naseer Memon. Mr. Memon said that the LBOD project commenced in the end of 1984 with an objective of reclaiming agricultural land in three districts on the left bank of Indus River viz. Nawabshah, Sanghar and Mirpur Khas. Since the project was planned and designed as an engineering project therefore it failed to capture broader canvas of social and environmental dimensions. As the project proceeded, it unfolded various counter-productive outcomes.

The fifth presentation 'The CSR practices of Engro Chemical Pakistan Limited - A Model in Excellence' was delivered by Wajid Hussain Junejo, Public Affairs Manager, Engro Chemical Pakistan Limited. Mr. Junejo said that a key objective of Engro's social strategy is to mainstream systems based on Responsible Business Pillars that ensure the organizational ability to implement the 10 principles of the UN Global Compact through embedded organizational processes.

During the general discussion phase, the discussion focused on four topics related with the issue of CSR:

- Government Responsibilities in facilitating CSR practices
- Civil Society capacity building in CSR related advocacy and action
- Critical sectors of concern in MNE operations in Pakistan
- Concerns for social and environmental degradation: Role of multilateral agencies ☐





Shehri 17th Annual General Meeting (Saturday, June 16th, 2007 at Shehri Office)

The 17th Annual General Meeting of Shehri-CBE, held on Saturday, June 16th, 2007 (5:00 pm), at Shehri office. The following managing committee members were present

1. Mr. Roland deSouza
Chairperson
2. Dr. Syed Raza Ali Gardezi
Vice Chairperson
3. Mrs. Amber Alibhai
General Secretary
4. Mr. Khatib Ahmed
Executive Member
5. Mr. Derrick Dean
Executive Member
6. Mr. Hanif A. Sattar
Executive Member

The following General Body members were present.

1. Mr. Nisar Hussain Baloch
Member
2. Ms. Naila Ahmed
Member
3. Mr. Sameer Hamid Dodhy
Member
4. Mrs. Radia Khatib
Member

AGENDA

1. To confirm the minutes of the last Annual General Meeting.
2. To approve and adopt General Secretary's report of Shehri's activities, for the year 2005.
3. To approve and adopt the audited statement of accounts for the year ended on December 31st, 2005.
4. To appoint and fix remuneration of auditors for the year 2006
5. To announce the names of the new Managing committee
6. Any other business with the permission of the chair.

The minutes of the 16th AGM were read out. Mr. Sameer Hamid Dodhy proposed and Ms. Naila Ahmed sec-



onded, the minutes of the meeting were confirmed. The General Secretary, Mrs. Amber Alibhai gave a summary of Shehri's activities for the year 2006, the details of which are mentioned in the Annual Report 2006. Mr. Hanif A Sattar proposed and Mr. Derrick Dean seconded, hence the Annual Activity report was adopted.

The statement of account was read out. Ms. Naila Ahmed proposed and Mr. Sameer Hamid Dodhy seconded. The audited accounts were adopted. (The accounts for the year ending December 31st 2006 were audited by M/s Haider & Company Chartered Accountants.) It was decided to retain M/s Haider & Company as auditors for the year 2007 and their fees would be Rs.7,000/- an increase of Rs.1,000/-. This was proposed by Mr. Khatib Ahmed and seconded by Mr. Nisar Baloch.

The election results announced by Mr. Khursheed Javed, Election Commissioner. Following members were elected.

1. Mr. Derrick Dean
Chairperson
2. Dr. Syed Raza Ali Gardezi
Vice Chairperson
3. Mrs. Amber Alibhai
General Secretary
4. Mr. Farooq Fazal
Treasurer
5. Mr. Hanif A Sattar
Member

6. Mr. Roland deSouza
Member
7. Mrs. Naila Ahmed
Member

The General Secretary Mrs. Amber Alibhai and the Chairperson Mr. Roland deSouza informed the members about the EIA hearings and about the Help Desk and how they help people. In the year 2006, Shehri filed 15 legal cases and one in Lahore to save Doongi Ground park. Shehri was also assisting residents in Lahore for the Lahore Bachao Tehrik.

Members were informed about the Karachi Elevated Expressway, Sugar Land City project, the NED Police project and other issues that Shehri is involved in.

The new members to the Managing Committee were welcomed Mr. Farooq Fazal, Mrs. Naila Ahmed and Mr. Derrick Dean. The outgoing members of the Managing Committee, Mr. Khatib Ahmed and Mr. Sheikh Rizwan Abdullah were thanked for the work and time they have given and it was hoped that they would continue to do so. Mr. Sameer Hamid Dodhy was asked to help in fundraising and in increasing the membership. He would also help in getting in touch with other similar organizations.

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks to the Chair. □



Shehri Workshop on attitude, tolerance & community policing Thursday, Friday, November 2-3, 2006 (Hotel Regent Plaza, Karachi)

Objectives of the workshop

- Increase participants understanding about community policing and its importance
- Enhance participants interpersonal communication skills (attitudes & behaviors)
- Help participants understand the importance of link between self and attitudes

Mrs. Amber Alibhai, General Secretary of Shehri, Mr. Khatib Ahmed, Member Shehri, Mr. Babar Bashir and Mr. Khairul Bashir of an Islamabad based NGO, Rozan spoke at the workshop, participated by over 30 police officers, and NGO workers. Later, certificates were also given to the participants.

Community policing is a collaborative effort between the police and the com-



munity that identifies problems of crime and disorder and involves all elements of the community in the search for solutions to these problems. It is founded on close, mutually beneficial ties between police and community members.

Effective community policing has a positive impact on reducing neighborhood crime, helping to reduce fear of crime and enhancing the quality of life in the community. It accomplishes

these things by combining the efforts and resources of the police, local government and community members.

Community policing offers a way for law enforcement to help re-energize our communities. Developing strong, self-sufficient communities is an essential step in creating an atmosphere in which serious crime will not flourish. □

Launching of Zimmadar Shehri Campaign - Wednesday, November 8, 2006 (3:00 pm) Karachi Press Club

A citizen's rally was organized by Shehri-Citizens for a Better Environment and the Helpline Trust to mobilize the sovereign citizens of Karachi to create new paradigms in their attitude, thinking and responsibility to act as responsible sovereign citizens. For many years people from civil society have come together and established platforms from where issues facing the sovereign citizens which are not being addressed adequately by the elected representatives and public servants are raised.

Unfortunately, despite all the efforts, time and money including threat to

their life these civil society groups who are forging ahead are being stone-walled and frustrated by these elected representatives and public servants. Now the time has come that all the sovereign citizens have to come together and break down these stone-walls if we are to get good governance, accountability and rule of law. For 58 years every objection, every voice, every pain, every hardship of the sovereign citizen has not been resolved nor heard but frustrated and stone-walled by lack of good governance, no transparency, lack of accountability and no rule of law. Yet the sovereign citizen continues to

remain quiet and allow the unilateral decision making of elected representatives and public servants to play havoc with his/her life.

We ask you what has this resulted in!!! We suffer by having no sense of security, we are all mentally besieged as prisoners in our own city, we have no rights, no water, no electricity, traffic congestions, pollution, unplanned expansion of the city, violations of all building and zoning laws, zero law and order, untold misery for commuters due to lack of an alternative transportation system, inadequate health facilities, education system in



tatters, no price control and no housing to name but a few, and sometimes when some courageous citizen cries foul they change the law or he disappears.

All advertisements and media blitz is about recreation and housing for the rich, what is the average citizen to do. The beach has been privatized, there is no recreation facility, parks are encroached, footpaths are encroached, the nallahs are encroached and now face it. Your basic rights are encroached.

See what has happened around you. When the Karachi Circular Railway was

systemically and deliberately destroyed by vested interest, we did not stand up, the result is before us, each and every road is grid locked. When they sold our drainage nallahs we kept quiet and even occupied and bought. Flats and offices in these illegal constructions built upon them. Little realizing the havoc they would play twenty years later after a few millimeters of rain. We allowed plazas to be built without adequate parking and supportive infrastructure i.e. water, electricity and sewerage. Look at the mess on Shahr-e-Faisal, Shahr-e-Iran, Shahr-e-Liaquat and each and every Shahr in this orphan city. There are no parks, citizens have to go to court to save the open spaces, they



cut down trees, there is no footpath to walk on and most important whether you are rich or poor nearly all of us have been directly or know of someone who has been a victim of violence and traffic accidents in Karachi.

Everyone is dreading the holiest month in our religious calendar because of rising prices and the traffic congestions that will follow.

Why are we citizens spineless. Do we all suffer from the battered child syndrome.

What more do you need to suffer before you will rise and take your lawful position as owners of this city. Remember if you do not demand change there will be no change in the quality of supply. What should you do;

- * Establish ownership of your city and country within yourself. Remember you are the sovereign owner.
- * Put your name in the electoral roll, go and vote.
- * Keep a check and balance on your elected representatives. Change them by participating in elections.
- * Keep a check on your public servants. They for the past 58 years have taken
- * over as owners and refuse to accept the fact that they are our paid public servants and are accountable and answerable to all of us. Do not be afraid of them, they only have as much strength and power as you allow them to have. □

Freedom of information: Citizens right to access information

Saturday, 11th November 2006, (9:30am-5:30.m) Hotel Marriott, Karachi

The right to access correct information is the right of every individual, this was the theme behind the training workshop arranged by Shehri-Citizens for a Better Environment in collaboration with Friedrich-Naumann-Foundation.

In Pakistan, freedom of information was introduced as an ordinance in 2004, but the participants of the workshop felt that this ordinance should be

turned into an Act of Parliament, to improve the prevalent conditions of valid information in the country.

A trainer, Mr. Zahid Abdullah, consultant from Centre for Peace and Development Initiative, Islamabad, delivered a lecture on the theme of the workshop. He said public has the right to access to information held by the public bodies and various government institutions. Once the individual has

the information, the person gets empowered. This eventually leads to direct or indirect impact on peoples' right. Giving out statistics, he said as many as 68 countries to-date have the right to this Act, which we finally achieved a few years back. He was of the view that rulers like master, as in the British Colonial era, controlled the lives of their people and denied them correct information. But the government must remember that it is not a



stakeholders but a shareholder in peoples' problems.

Mr. Zahid Abdullah cited the fact, that the major principles of 'Freedom of Information' requires maximum disclosure of details, obligation to publish correct rules, open meetings, the process to facilitate complete access and more importantly the protection of whistleblowers.

The prime fault lies in the prevailing poor conditions of 'Human Rights' and 'Corruption' that takes place in our society, when the government fails to become transparent and accountable. It is observed that whenever information is withheld, it is because the politics of vested interest of many parties that are at stake is involved behind the scene.

Public access to information is crucial for good governance and for the



democratic process to make headway in the country. Its importance can be assessed from the fact that it affected the citizens right to participation.

At the end of workshop, he prescribed the means through which one can obtain complete information from any government machinery by forwarding a clean-cut procedure of filing a form and accessing information by paying a

specified amount.

Over 60 participants from various government departments, NGOs, media, civil society groups attended the workshop. □

The Solid Waste Disposal System in Karachi - A Fact Sheet

Karachi generates about 6,113 tons of solid waste every day. About 5,057 tons is lifted and 1,057 tons is not lifted. About 10% of this waste is removed at source by housewives and sold to about 15,000 kabaris who pick up the waste from peoples homes. This solid waste consists of glass, plastic, metal and paper. In addition, another 600 tons of solid waste is collected from kutchra kundis and from the streets and markets by waste pickers. This waste consists of paper, rags, plastic, metal objects, glass and bones. Garbage lifting costs Rs.1.08 million a day, while Rs.233 a day is spent on transportation.

Sweepers employed by with the municipal agencies or hired by residents, provide door to door garbage collection service. From the households, the waste is taken to neighborhood collection points (concrete/steel bins) stationed at roadsides, on pathways, in parks, playgrounds. The garbage may also be dumped openly in storm drains, parks/playgrounds, back lanes etc. In such places, garbage is either burnt or is collected by the municipal agencies refuse vans and transported to the landfill sites (non-engineered sites, where garbage is dumped and openly burnt) located in the outskirts of the city, one at Jam Chakro, Surjani Town and the other at Gond Pass, Hub River Road, 30-35 km from the city centre..

In the absence of any officially provided service in the recycle/reuse of solid waste, the informal sector has filled this gap to a great extent. The informal sector comprises of an organized chain of actors, starting from the rag pickers on the streets to the recycling factory owners. It is a flourishing business, which at a conservative estimate, accounts for 15%-20% of the total generated waste of the city. This sector provides employment to more than 55,000 families and had an annual turnover of Rs.1.2 billion. More than 1000 recycling units are operative in the informal sector.

About 2.7 tons of waste is generated by 200 hospitals having total bed strength of 9000. It contains 540 kg hazardous waste and 2,160 kg of non-hazardous waste. For disposing of hospital waste, some private and government run hospitals have installed imported/locally developed waste incinerators. The City District Government has also installed two waste incinerators in the city. They cater only to the waste of about 140 health care units and are presently running at very low efficiency.

In the areas not covered by the City Government such as the cantonment areas, Clifton, Malir, Faisal and Korangi cantonments have 34 vehicles that collect an estimated 311 tons of garbage each day and incur a daily cost of Rs.197, 000 on sweeping and transportation. □



SHEHRI ADVOCACY

In this section, we highlight some of our ongoing advocacy work and seek active citizen participation for ensuring protection of public interest.

Industrial / Domestic waste discharges in defence installations in Karachi

Shehri's observations and comments after hearing the 2-day Senate Sub-committee hearings are as follows:

1. The land comprising Karachi has approximately 27 owners all of whom have their own leases and building rules. These rules are violated with impunity in connivance with local officials and in collusion with KWSB, CDGK, KESC and other related departments.
2. There is also a multiplicity of municipal agencies responsible for the handling, treating, and disposal of liquid and solid wastes in their jurisdictions. Some of these municipal agencies have sub-contracted the jobs to private parties or CDGK, but cannot ensure that an adequate job is done
3. In violation of town-planning schemes and notified land-use, much land is being unlawfully used for industrial, cottage industry, and marketing purposes. The inner city has been partially converted into small factories and industrial units and ware-housing for chemicals, food, textile, machinery, etc. Among these are:
 - * They also are used for warehousing and re-packaging of chemicals, food, clothing.
 - * Textile and stitching factories are housed all over P.E.C.H.S., Nazimabad, Saddar, North Karachi, Landhi, Malir, to name just a few areas.
 - * Golimar and Pak Colony in SITE Town are home to the largest marble and stone processing factories. They pollute the air, the water, the nallahs and also dump waste into Gutter Bagicha.
 - * Meat, poultry and fish stalls open on every corner, in blatant violation of municipal regulations, polluting the area with offal and waste, attracting carrion birds.
4. Notified katchi abadis are 539, spread over approximately 12,445 acres all over Karachi. The un-notified katchi abadis are 1100, spread over 20,000 acres approximately. These katchi abadis are housing furniture making, spray painting, ice factories, plastic making, toys, rubber slippers, shoes, die-casting units, bleaching, dyeing stitching, small industries, carpet making, hand looms, paper making, chip boards, slaughter houses etc. These units use all kinds of chemicals which are pumped directly into the nallas and the KW&SB sewers which are not equipped to handle this kind of effluent
5. Approximately 300mgd of untreated and toxic sewerage finds its way into the ocean. Another 100mgd pollutes the ground water
6. Over 50% of solid waste is not collected by the CDGK and the other municipal agencies. Informal recycling (by rag-pickers) manages to rescue some of reusable materials. There is no proper landfill site in the city; Karachi just has dumping grounds at some outskirts.
7. Applicable laws governing generation and handling of liquid and solid wastes include:
 - * Environmental Protection Act 1997 r/w numerous subordinate legislation/rules, including
 - * National Environment Quality Standards (NEQS), 2001
 - * Review of EIA & IEE Regulations, 2000
 - * Sindh Local Government Ordinance 2001 r/w numerous subordinate legislation/rules
 - * Cantonment Act 1924
 - * Sindh Fisheries Ordinance, 1980
 - * Pakistan Penal Code, 1860
 - * WP Fisheries Ordinance, 1961 S
 - * Ports Act, 1908
 - * Pakistan Territorial Waters & Maritime Zones Act 1976
 - * KPT Act 1860/1994
 - * Factories Act, 1934

There is no dearth of laws prohibiting the pollution we see around us; there



is only a dearth of will to implement the laws!

8. As per NEQS 2001, all installations are required to emit liquid effluents into the public sewers only in conformance with NEQS standards.

Consequently, industrial and other locations generating toxic/aggressive effluents have to provide special in-house treatment before dumping into the public sewer. This practice is virtually non-existent (except for some multi-nationals). The three KWSB treatment plants of TP-1, TP-2 and TP-3 (present capacity 95mgd) are equipped to handle residential/domestic municipal (or previously treated industrial) waste only.

9. Additionally, NEQS 2001 prohibits discharge of any kind of effluent (even if it is in accordance with NEQS standards for the sea) into the sea within 10 miles of mangroves or important estuaries (like Chinna Creek or Korangi Creek, etc). Consequently, the discharge of all liquid effluent from treatment plants into the sea within 10 miles of Karachi is unlawful! The simple implementation of this rule would save all defence installations in Karachi harbour!

Shehri's recommendations are as follows;

- * All land owners and municipal agencies of the city must adhere and strictly follow their lease conditions and zoning/ landuse rules.
- * Industrial parks must be established and all illegal small and large industries be shifted to these parks. These industrial parks must have their collective treatment plants, and each

industry must be made to comply with NEQS 2001.

- * The existing industries established in SITE, KITE, Landhi Industrial area, Federal 'B' Area Industrial Area, and North Karachi Industrial Area must have collective treatment plants, and monitor the compliance of their individual industries with NEQS 2001.
- * A public education campaign (safai nisf iman hai) must be mounted for at least ten years to reduce the buildup of public pollution and garbage all over the city.

This is specially so with regards to food and related items.

- * Unlicensed and unhygienic food outlets and meat/poultry/fish stalls must be shut down
- * The siting of locations (industrial areas markets, etc) that generate excessive solid waste must be made keeping in view the flight path of defence and other aircraft.
- * The establishment of proper landfill sites, and the setting up of an effective garbage collection system (probably in the private sector) is required immediately.

Since 'garbage is gold', this should not be impossible.

With these observations and recommendations, we enclose newspaper articles, correspondence, public notices and various rules that are being flouted. □

Unlawful Occupation of Church Property

We refer to the news-item in Dawn dated June 04, 2007, stat-

ing that a builder has illegally purchased and is demolishing a heritage/amenity church property.

We would like draw the attention of the relevant officials to the following:

1. Church plots are amenity plots and cannot be converted to commercial or residential use under law
2. Federal Gazette Notification (Ordinance No.F.2(1)/2002) dated 22 January 2002, issued by the Ministry of Law, Justice, Human Rights and Parliamentary Affairs, which has been promulgated "to protect the properties of minority communities meant for their communal use" clearly prohibits the sale or transfer of communal properties (like churches) without NOC from the Federal Government.

Relevant officials are kindly requested to investigate the matter and ensure that the interests of the minorities are not usurped. □

Korangi Creek Industrial Park (KCIP) Project

Under section 12(2) of the PEPA (Review of IBB & EIA) Regulations 2000, the DG shall constitute a "Committee of Experts" to review the EIA. Please let us know the names/addresses of the members of this "Committee of Experts".

Under section 12(3), a Committee may be constituted to inspect the site of the project and submit a report.

Under section 12(4), a quantitative & qualitative assessment of all comments, documents, data and views (collated u/s 10(5)) is to be prepared by EPA. The following points must be noted:



In addition to the legal duty of each industry that is established in the KCIP to ensure that their liquid and gaseous effluents comply with NEQS 2000, the EIA approval must charge the KCIP with the duty of ensuring that the combined liquid effluent and the gaseous effluents of the industrial park so comply.

Relevant officials are kindly requested to provide us with details of the compliance with land-use change procedures mentioned in para-5.4 of the EIA Report. □

EIA for KESC's 220MW & 575MW Generation Enhancement Projects

Shehri's observations are as follows:

1. SEPA must examine the KESC's answers and the points involved, and not merely act as a forwarding post-office.
2. The answers provided by KESC are very generalized and do not adequately and specifically address the issues raised by us.
3. Whether or not KESC has been submitting regular monitoring reports to SEPA on the liquid effluents and air emissions from KTPS and BQTPS has not been answered.

Please have KESC provide us with a copies of:

- a) the report on the Third Party Environmental Audit conducted at the time of privatization
- b) last six months' reports from the Static Emission Monitoring Equipment installed in 1994 at BPQS No. 3, 4, 5 & 6.
4. The temperature of the discharge into the sea of the once-through

cooling systems is not supported with independent audit measurements. Generalized statements of KESC are hardly an acceptable substitute. Please have KESC provide verified data.

The effect of this thermal discharge on the mangroves and marine life has not been discussed.

5. As reported (see Annexure-1) in the June 2007 issue of 'Spectrum1, the magazine of the Institute of Electrical & Electrical Engineers (IEEE) of the USA:

"AIR POLLUTION: Particulate matter smaller than 10 micrometers in diameter (pm10) is the most dangerous to human health, because it can pass through the nose and throat and enter the lungs - leading to asthma, lung cancer, cardiovascular problems, and premature death. Of the megacities, Karachi, Pakistan, had by far the worst pm10 problem in 1999, the last year for which complete data were available.

The article can be downloaded from <http://spectrum.ieee.org/jun07/5148> How is KESC trying not to exacerbate this situation?

6. The contravention of the common-law 'Public Trust Doctrine1 (which provides for unfettered access to the entire shore of the sea for all citizens to fish, swim, boat, recreate, etc) is apparent at both sites, KTPS and BQTPS. How can this be addressed?
7. Some of the issues that have been glossed over by KESC include:
- c) Plans to employ more environment-friendly electricity generation techniques
- d) Reason for partial combined-cycle operation at KTPS

- e) Control of rampant theft of electricity throughout the city
- f) Employment of 'electrical energy conservation1 as a preferred means of 'generating' electricity
- g) Organizational structure to ensure environmental compliance and safety
- h) Provisions for gas-turbine inlet air-cooling to conserve fuel
- i) Copies of SMART documents submitted to SEPA over the past two years
- j) Admitted violations of NEQS 2000 in the concentrations of elements in effluents
- k) Admitted violation of Note-6 of NEQS 2000 effluents (near mangroves/estuary)
- l) Programme for reduction in SO2 and NOX emissions
- m) Provisions to eliminate marine life destruction through impingement /entrainment in intake structures.
- n) Discharge of waste-water directly into the sea due to the non-availability of KWSB or PQA treatment plants
8. Please provide us with the names of the 'Committee of Experts' (half of them should be from the private sector) being established to review the EIAs. Also send us copies of the the quantitative and qualitative assessments of all comments collated by SEPA.

We look forward to hearing from SEPA protecting the fragile coastal marine environment of Karachi. □

Legal cases filed during the year 2006

CPLA # 522-L/06	Shehri-CBE & Ors. Vs. Lahore Development Authority & Ors.	Doongi Ground (Appeal against dismissal of Stay-Order in ICA 45/06)
CP # 256/06	Abdul Qadir & Ors. Vs. CDGK & Ors.	Sana Avenue GRE 289, Garden East
CP # 610/06	Muhammad Rafiq & Ors. Vs. KBCA & Ors.	Parsa Palace A-4, Bath Island
CA # /06	Shehri-CBE & Ors. Vs. Lahore Development Authority & Ors.	Doongi Ground (Appeal against dismissal of 1226/06 for nonpros ecution)
CPLA # /06	Gvot. of Pakistan etc. Vs. Shehri-CBE & Ors.	Desalination Plant, D.H.A
HRC # 4811/06	Mian Tariq Paganwalla Vs. Province of Sindh & Ors.	17 buildings in Block 3, PECHS, Karachi.
HCA # 106/06	Abdul Qadir & Ors. Vs. CDGK & Ors.	Sana Avenue GRE 289, Garden East
HCA # 313/06	Amber Alibhai & Ors. Vs. CDGK & Ors.	83-F/2, PECHS
CP # D-486/06	Mrs. Masooma Mehmoodi & Ors. Vs. Tayyab & Ors.	152-A/2, PECHS, Karachi
Suit # 299/06	Amber Alibhai & Ors. Vs. Sher Afghan & Ors.	144-L/2, PECHS, Karachi
Suit # 364/06	Shehri-CBE & Ors. Vs. Province of Sindh & Ors.	146-D/2, PECHS, Karachi
Suit # 366/06	Sultan Ahmed & Ors. Vs. Altaf Pardesi & Ors.	44-45, Overseas Cooperative Housing Society
Suit # 423/06	Sohail Selmi & Ors. Vs. Federation of Pakistan & Ors.	Amenity Park 45 SNPA, Block 7 & 8, Shabbirabad
Suit # 1059/06	Navaid Hussain & Ors. Vs. Jahangir Siddiqui & Ors.	Citi Heights 151-N/2, PECHS, Karachi.
Suit # 1385/06	Mrs. Masooma Mehmoodi & Ors. Vs. Tayyab & Ors.	152-A/2, PECHS, Karachi.



CITIZEN POWER

A Citizen Report Card for Karachi - The Water Sector

Shehri highlights a commendable initiative undertaken by KW&SB to seek consumer feedback on the level and quality of services to the consumer and other related aspects.

One of the major challenges faced in the water and sanitation sector in Karachi, particularly as it relates to the major formal and informal service providers is that of ensuring 'accountability'. There is no formal mechanism of getting citizen feedback on services and redressing consumers concerns. As such all policy and planning initiatives taken by the service delivery institutions are devoid of the critical requirement of consumer feedback and perceptions.

One methodology that has the potential of successfully tackling this problem is the concept and practice of Citizen Report Card (CRC). CRC, pioneered in Bangalore in 1993 by the Public Affairs Centre, Bangalore, is based on the premise that feedback on service quality, collected from communities with the help of a sample survey, provides a reliable basis for communities and local governments to engage in a dialogue and partnership action to improve the delivery of public services.

The CRC, if conducted periodically (Performance Tracking) can track changes in service quality over time. Comparison of findings across CRCs will reveal improvements or worsening in service delivery. Application of CRCs before and after introducing a new program/policy can assist in measuring its impact. As such, it is a process that needs to be sustained and institutionalized in order to benefit properly and fully from its potential.

However, prior to implementing this mechanism on any institutionalized basis there is first a need to develop and test through a carefully designed 'Pilot Project', the framework of a participatory 'Citizen Report Card'

that can:

- * Provide citizens and utility with qualitative and quantitative information about prevailing standards and gaps in service delivery
- * Measure the level of public awareness about citizen's rights and responsibilities
- * Help in identification of weak-

- * A credible part of the city or sector where the effort is started
- * Politically neutral
- * Committed to improvements in the W&S sector, over the long term
- * Able to oversee survey related field-work (though not necessarily able to carry it out) and interpret collected feedback



The Citizen Report Card: Seeking the critical consumer feedback

- nesses in the service monitoring system
- * Compare feedback across locations/demographic groups to identify segments where service provision is significantly weak
- * Identify areas where the institutions responsible for service provision have not achieved mandated or expected service standards
- * Link findings to identify specific demand based improvements in services
- * Willing to disseminate both the positive and negative findings
- * Experienced or at least agreeable to work with multiple constituents (media, government, CSOs etc.)

The identification of the 'Stakeholder Forum' would need to be followed by the selection of the localities where the 'Pilot Project', would be conducted. An open discussion of problems and issues can best take place when people feel secure. Investigators conducting surveys and others involved in the CRC process should feel secure conducting the survey and disseminating both the positive and negative aspects of the findings.

The CRC methodology is most effective where individuals can freely comment on the government without fear or punishment. Feedback is likely to reflect the true experience of the

An effective design and implementation of the 'Citizen Report Card', process would require the identification of a 'Stakeholder Forum' for managing the process that in turn holds individual and focus group discussions with civil society groups/individuals, other relevant formal and informal sector stakeholders. The 'Lead Agency' should ideally fulfill the following criteria:



respondent. Where individuals fear repercussions for commenting on the government, the reliability of the collected feedback will be questionable. In many areas of Karachi, civil society organizations make up a very important sector of society. An active civil society indicates the presence of high levels of citizen initiative and mechanisms useful to carrying out a CRC.

CSOs help to ensure the independence and use of findings. Strong networks among CSOs improve the possibility that findings will be distributed and translated into efforts to improve service delivery. It is however, important to be conscious of highly biased groups which may change the findings to promote their own interests. The absence of civil society will limit options to distribute findings and follow up efforts related to advocacy and reforms. However, some local proxies for civil society such as semi-government organizations or other public

entities that offer some benefits of civil society can be considered.

The 'Pre-Survey', process would involve individual/focus group discussions with relevant stakeholders, followed by the preparation of the 'Survey instrument design' that should emanate from the statement of purpose. Usually the statement of purpose during a reform process relates to the following feedback areas: access, usage, problem incidence, problem resolution, staff behavior, service quality, corruption and overall consumer satisfaction.

The success of the actual survey work depends on proper management and coordination of the field processes. The field coordinator plays an important role at this stage. He/she ensures that the key stages of the survey process are well carried out. The key stages include:

- Training of investigators - this would include basic orientation to purpose of CRC
- Implementation of survey design
- Quality checks during interviews

The 'Post Survey Analysis' would involve the creation of a database of citizen responses - and stage two generation of findings as per the statement of purpose. These findings would then be analyzed to establish the current state of services and for recommendations for improvement

The scope of dissemination relates directly to the objectives of the CRC. The target audience should be informed of the findings within a time frame meaningful for follow-up action. In this case the target audience would include KW&SB, GoS/CDGK, general public, media, CSOs, donors and supporters. □

Slum Rehabilitation Scheme in Mumbai

In a significant departure from the earlier stance on slums, the Afzalpurkar Committee in the early 1990s recommended the use of Mumbai's land as a resource to solve the slum problem. One key feature of this approach is that additional area (permissible Floor Space Index or FSI) would be allocated for construction of tenements that, in turn, would be sold in the market. Funds from such sales were expected to cross-subsidize tenements which could be given free of cost to slum dwellers. Accordingly, modified 'Development Control Regulations' were sanctioned in 1997, and the Slum Rehabilitation Authority (SRA) was formed as an autonomous

independent body. By capitalizing on the high cost of space, the SRS tries to provide saleable commercial space to the private sector as an incentive to put in capital and build multi-storey rehabilitation housing which could be given free of cost to slum dwellers. The SRS is a self-financed scheme, under which the entire expenditure is cross-subsidized from the sale component (incentive FSI).

From the mid-1990s when the SRA started to April 2005, an estimated 128,000 slum dwellers have benefited from the program, against a target of 800,000. Rehabilitation is nearing completion in more than 200 schemes, covering about

33,000 tenements or more than 100,000 slum dwellers (SRA, 2005). The SRS provides for transit accommodation during implementation; the facilities include a dwelling unit, kitchen, water, and individual or common sanitation arrangements. Progress under this scheme appears to be accelerating but has hitherto fallen short of expectation. Constraints include the land market, slum densities, developers; poor or inadequate performance and the scarcity of financially attractive locations. □

- Courtesy: Partnering with Slum Communities for Sustainable Sanitation in a Megalopolis - WSP - South Asia



Activist's Toolkit

by
Khatib Ahmed



GOOD GOVERNANCE

The concept of "governance" is as old as human civilization. Simply put ENVIRONMENT "governance" means

- * the process of decision-making
- * the process by which decisions are implemented (or not implemented).

Governance is the process of

- * Decision-making
- * The process by which decisions are implemented

Government is one of the actors in governance. Other actors involved in governance vary depending on the level of government that is under discussion. The situation in urban areas is much more complex. At the national level, actors may include:

- * Media
- * Lobbyists
- * International donors
- * Multi-national corporations, etc may play a role in decision-making or in influencing the decision-making process.

All actors other than government and the police/military are grouped together as part of the "civil society." In some countries in addition to the civil society.

- * Organized crime syndicates also influence decision-making, particularly in urban areas and at the national level.

Similarly formal government structures are one means by which decisions are arrived at and implemented. At the national level, informal decision-making structures, such as

- * "kitchen cabinets" or
- * informal advisors may exist.

In urban areas,

- * organized crime syndicates such as the "land Mafia" may influence decision-making.

In some rural areas locally

- * powerful families may make or influence decision-making. Such, informal decision-making is often

the result of

- * corrupt practices or leads to corrupt practices.

Major Principles of Good Governance

1. Participation

- * Participation by both men and women is a key cornerstone of good governance.
- * Participation could be either direct or through legitimate intermediate institutions or representatives.
- * It is important to point out that representative democracy does not necessarily mean that the concerns of the most vulnerable in society would be taken into consideration in decision making.
- * Participation needs to be informed and organized.

2. Rule of law

Good governance requires fair legal frameworks that are enforced impartially. It also requires full protection of human rights, particularly those of

- * minorities.
- * Impartial enforcement of laws requires
- * an independent judiciary
- * an impartial and incorruptible police force.

3. Transparency

Transparency means that decisions taken and their enforcement are done in a manner that follows

- * rules and regulations.
- * information is freely available and directly accessible to those who will be affected by such decisions and their enforcement.

4. Responsiveness

Good governance requires that institutions and processes try to serve all stakeholders within

- * a reasonable timeframe.

5. Consensus oriented

There are several actors and as many view points in a given society. Good governance requires

- * Mediation of the different interests in society to reach a broad consensus in society on what is in the best interest of the whole community and how this can be achieved.

- * It also requires a broad and long-term perspective on what is needed for sustainable human development and how to achieve the goals of such development.

- * This can only result from an understanding of the historical, cultural and social contexts of a given society or community.

6. Equity and inclusiveness

A society's well being depends on ensuring that all its members feel that they have

- * a stake in it and do not feel excluded from the mainstream of society. This requires all groups, but particularly the most
- * vulnerable, have opportunities to improve or maintain their well being.

7. Effectiveness and efficiency

Good governance means that processes and institutions

- * produce results that meet the needs of society
- * while making the best use of resources at their disposal.

The concept of efficiency in the context of good governance also covers the sustainable use of natural resources and the protection of the environment.

8. Accountability

Accountability is a key requirement of good governance. Not only governmental institutions but also the private sector and civil society organizations must be organizations must be Accountable to the public and to their institutional stakeholders.

- * Accountability cannot be enforced without Transparency and the rule of law.

CONCLUSION

From the above discussion it should be clear that good governance is an ideal which is difficult to achieve in its totality. Very few countries and societies have come close to achieving good governance in its totality. However, to ensure sustainable human development, actions must be taken to work towards this ideal with the aim of making it a reality.

Remember

The price of Liberty is eternal vigilance.



ENVIRONMENT

The LBOD crisis - A planning failure

Naseer Memon discusses the social and environmental repercussion of the LBOD project and subsequent efforts to manage the crisis

Left Bank Outfall Drain (LBOD) episode has once again proved that technologies and modern sciences would always remain incomplete without appreciating traditional wisdom. The recent study report of the Inspection Panel of The World Bank has confirmed what illiterate fishermen and poor coastal communities have been predicting about the fate of the project since years. In fact they predicted LBOD's failure at the time when experts were day night busy in making tall claims of their engineering splendor.

Generally in Pakistan and specially in Sindh the magnitude of water logging and salinity has surpassed alarming limits and the systems needs thorough revamp, a part of which is drainage in addition to several other desirable steps. Extensive Irrigation network with 3 barrages, 14 canals, more than 1,400 minors/distributaries and over 40,000 field channels certainly requires matching drainage facilities and modern water conservation techniques to maintain its productivity.

Situation has been worst particularly on the left bank of Indus, which receives bulk of river flows and supports larger part of canal command area. Due to various reasons, left bank

areas started developing water logging and salinity soon after the commissioning of barrages. LBOD project commenced in the end of 1984 with an objective of reclaiming agricultural land in three districts on the left bank of Indus viz. Nawabshah, Sanghar and Mirpur Khas. Since the project was planned and designed as an engineer-

Without extensive participation of stakeholders, specially local communities, a project of such scale is bound to breed troubles. Stakeholder participation in true spirit is considered as key to success and acceptability of mega projects. Regrettably LBOD was devoid of any trace of stakeholder involvement barring few cosmetic attempts, when it was too late and too little.

ing project therefore it failed to capture broader canvas of social and environmental dimensions. As the project proceeded, it unfolded various counter-productive outcomes. Apart from usual snags and inefficiencies which are commonly found in projects of such magnitude, it ignited more serious questions of development approach. The below mentioned facts give few glimpses of violations of standard development practices.

"The project was benefiting people in one area at the cost of

other end. The three beneficiary districts had to transport their effluent through Badeen, which had no direct benefit from the project; it rather paid the cost of all benefits going to upper end. This negated a fundamental principle of development i.e. equal distribution of benefits. People of Bdeen became the worst loser as a result of failure of Tidal Link

channel of LBOD. Development benefiting one end at the cost of other end is nothing but the antithesis of development as was LBOD.

- Any project costing delicate eco-systems are not in conformity with principles of sustainable development. LBOD caused irreversible damage to fragile lake system comprising of two Ramsar sites namely Jubbo and Nareri. After the collapse of Cholri weir and over 50 breaches in Tidal Link canal, whole eco-system in the lake complex lost its very existence for all practical purposes. Voiceless fishermen paid the price of this disaster as their livelihood was mainly dependent on the lake system bio-diversity. A major reason of this was sheer negligence towards conducting proper environmental assessments of various project components.
- Without extensive participation of stakeholders, specially local communities, a project of such scale is bound to breed troubles. Stakeholder participation in true spirit is considered as key to success and acceptability of mega projects. Regrettably LBOD was devoid of any trace of stakeholder involvement barring few cosmetic attempts, when it was too late and too little. Not only that stakeholder consultation was not carried out at desirable scale but the project designers and executives never paid heed to apprehensions and genuine complains



of stakeholders. All this culminated in bad reputation of project executants and financiers. No wonder, what Inspection Panel of the World Bank has revealed in its documents is not much different from what local communities and stakeholders have been saying since years but always went unheard of.

After the project brought environmental and socio-economic disaster, specially for Badeen communities, local communities approached the Inspection Panel of the World Bank. The Inspection Panel is a forum where affectees can approach for non-partisan investigation of any World Bank funded project. The Inspection Panel mobilized on request of the affectees, submitted its findings to World Bank in July 2006. The Panel's report established that the project was victim of a flawed design, bad execution and poor monitoring. In response to findings of the Inspection Panel, The World Bank chalked out a Plan of Action comprising of short term, medium term and long term measures for damage control. However this action plan repeats a major flaw of LBOD project i.e. lack of consultation with the project affectees. The Inspection highlighted the fact that the stakeholders were not properly consulted in LBOD project at key stages. Interestingly the World Bank started remedial measures with the same mistake and no stakeholder consultation was carried out while designing the damage control and compensation Action Plan. As a result of which important stakeholders such as civil society and local affectees have started disowning this plan at the very outset.

A World Bank document ELABORATION OF THE SHORT TERM ACTION PLAN issued on 30th Oct 06 outlines an Action Plan. A critical review of the document reveals that

the Plan of Action offers very little to redress miseries of the affectees of LBOD project. Let us take a cursory look over the proposed actions.

The Coastal Areas Development Program (CADP): According to the plan, it will be implemented by the World Bank funded Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund (PPAF) through its partner NGOs. Scope of the project includes (i) access to basic services and infrastructure (ii) higher incomes through improved crops, fisheries and livestock production, marketing and micro-finance services (iii) secure access to, and better management of the coastal area natural resources; (iv) viable community organizations that can operate in partnership with the public and private sector and NGOs and, (v) improved access to high quality education, information, training and better nutrition and health.

No doubt Pakistan Poverty Alleviation is doing an appreciable work in improving lives of poor echelon of society. However it is not exclusively meant for LBOD affectees. PPAF is already present in 96 districts of Pakistan and implementing its poverty alleviation program through 56 partner organizations. It has completed its first phase in 2004 and now spreading its coverage. It would be pertinent to mention that the PPAF is being implemented through a 90 million US\$ credit of the World Bank and the CADP would be the part of this portfolio. Obviously a loan can never be considered as compensation. It is strange to note that miseries inflicted

by one loan are being compensated through another loan. Principally and morally the Bank should not only issue a compensation grant for affectees but should also write off the loan given for LBOD project.

Since Civil Society has serious reservations on the way LBOD was implemented without active consultation

Only assessment without any clearly defined follow-up would hardly serve any good to the devastated lakes. The lake system rehabilitation would be a highly difficult job in the given conditions where in absence of Cholri Weir, the lakes' salinity levels have surpassed even sea salinity levels.

with and involvement of stakeholders, the Bank should ensure that the compensation package is also designed, executed and independently monitored through credible civil society organizations, with proper representation of the affectees. It would be pertinent to recommend that a CADP Program Steering Committee should look after the CADP affairs with at least 50% representation from civil

society, specially the affectees.

Socio-economic and Environmental Assessment of dhands: According to the plan, the Bank and Sindh Irrigation and Drainage Authority (SIDA) will under take this assessment with two objectives. (i) to determine the extent and severity of the adverse impacts that have occurred on the people living near the dhands or in areas that have been directly impacted, and formulate short-term measures and long-term livelihood assistance programs; and (ii) to determine the present physical and ecological condition of the dhands paying particular attention to water quality, biodiversity and habitat, and the productivity and quality of the fishery.

Ecological disaster inflicted upon the lake system is enormous. Socio-economic and Environmental Assessment



could be an appropriate beginning but World Bank need to commit for development and implementation of a long term "Lake System Conservation and Management Plan". Only assessment without any clearly defined follow-up would hardly serve any good to the devastated lakes. The lake system rehabilitation would be a highly difficult job in the given conditions where in absence of Cholri Weir, the lakes' salinity levels have surpassed even sea salinity levels. Knowing SIDA's institutional state of affairs it is unrealistic to assign such task to SIDA, which lacks in relevant human resource and institutional capacity.

This scale of work can only be done by highly experienced conservation organizations of international repute. Proper involvement of local fishing communities would be a key to success of any such plan. Rehabilitation of fishing communities largely depends on proper rehabilitation of the lake system.

RAPID ASSESSMENT OF EXISTING LOCAL GOVERNMENT FLOOD RISK MANAGEMENT SYSTEM: The study aims to identify the gaps in the system and a program to fill these gaps. Immediate measures outlined for vulnerable villages include construction of flood platforms and refuges, construction of small flood bunds, improving drains, and reducing isolation and improving mobility by improving village roads.

In short term this may have some positive impact on certain localities but surely it would not reduce the scale of vulnerability of Badeen communities against perpetual natural disasters compounded by man-made causes such as failure of Tidal Link.

Rapid assessment can also be a useful start but would remain always insufficient unless entailed with a

"Comprehensive Disaster Mitigation and Management Plan for Lower Sindh". Since the Tidal Link of LBOD has been a major blockade against natural south-east-ward flows of storm water thus causing flood-bound disasters, the World Bank should commit developing and implementation of such long term plan to avert future disasters. In the given resources and institutional capacity, local stakeholders will not be able to benefit from only assessment of flood risk management system. It requires enhancement of capacities and necessary infrastructure e.g. trained human resource, equipment, basic infrastructure and flood warning & emergency response systems.

STRENGTHENING OF THE RIGHT BANK OF THE LBOD SPINAL DRAIN AND KPOD: Under this action the Bank, in collaboration with WAPDA and the Sindh Irrigation and Drainage Authority (SIDA), plans to undertake a detailed field examination of the right embankment of the spinal drain and KPOD. The mission will identify vulnerable sections, identify specific measures that may be needed to complete secure repair of the old breaches and prepare a detailed maintenance plan including estimates of the cost of civil works. The Bank would be willing to provide support for its implementation if requested.

What is very transparent now; that the maintenance of KPOD or Tidal Link will not eliminate the risk of LBOD bound disasters. Through repair and maintenance the KPOD can be restored to its original state at the best, which already succumbed to active erosion and flood. The outfall mechanism of LBOD needs a thorough revision and more serious consideration of alternate options such as outfall through DPOD, Rann of Kutch and Kori Creek. The present outfall approach has already proved a failure

and there is little wisdom in repairing the existing system, which will cost as much as a new construction would do.

ACCELERATED PROCESSING OF WSIP PROJECT AND ESTABLISHMENT OF THE FLOOD MANAGEMENT PLANNING PROGRAM: The Bank and GOS have agreed to establish such a planning program and undertake its implementation immediately when the new Water Sector Improvement Project (WSIP) project becomes effective. The WSIP project is expected to be presented to the Board in February 2007. The planning studies will include options to improve LBOD, and options to meet storm and agricultural drainage needs.

WSIP is in fact a continuity of USS 786 million National Drainage Program, which could not meet its targets. Also the WSIP is another loan of 140 million dollars and thus can not be considered as part of any compensation to LBOD affectees. The unfinished LBOD was transferred to NDP and now unfinished NDP is being transferred to WSIP. No one knows which new off spring of WSIP will shoulder its unfinished agenda. Strange enough that NDP with such huge loan ended up with a large part incomplete and people of this country are not even informed about the fate of 786 million dollar project before taking another loan of 140 million dollars.

The Action Plan offered by the World Bank shows that there is no genuine commitment to compensate the affectees of a failed mega project and now the dead body of the failed project is being used to pile new loans on poor people of the country. □

*Naseer Memon is
Provincial Coordinator - Sindh,
LEAD Pakistan*



COASTAL DEVELOPMENT

Development of Bundal and Buddo - environmental concerns

The Urban Poor Associates, Philippines, voices concern on the commercial development of the Bundal and Buddo Island to the Federal Ministry of Environment, Government of Pakistan.

Our organization received information from civil society organizations in Pakistan about the sale and development of the two islands Bundal and Buddo, Sindh. They say the islands and its environs are home to rich flora and fauna of the Indus River Delta. It is one of the few remaining tracts of healthy mangroves of the roosting and breeding grounds of various migratory and resident birds.

This project will deprive poor fishermen of the Sindh coast from their fishing grounds and mangrove nurseries thus eroding their remaining meager livelihood resources. About 4,000 to 5,000 fishing boats use Korangi and Phitti creeks.

regions by World Wildlife Fund (WWF) and the islands are also identified as part of High Priority Areas of conservation interest by International Union for the Conservation of Nature (IUCN).

The sale and development of these islands will adversely affect the livelihood of over 500,000 fisherfolk and their families. This project will deprive poor fishermen of the Sindh coast from their fish-

Environmental Impact Assessment, which is mandatory under Pakistan Environmental Protection Act 1997. It would appear then that your ministry is violating this law.

We also understand that neither the provincial nor the federal government has undertaken any consultation with the likely affected persons of the project.

Civil society groups of Pakistan have expressed their serious concern of this ill-conceived project and consider this project a violation of all fundamental principles of sustainable development.

The breeding grounds of the endangered marine Green Turtle exist on Dingi and Bundaar Islands. This rich biodiversity will lose its existence in the wake of proposed development. The islands are part of resource-rich eco-system of Indus Delta, which has been included in 200 Eco-

ing grounds and mangrove nurseries thus eroding their remaining meager livelihood resources. About 4,000 to 5,000 fishing boats use Korangi and Phitti creeks.

These passages to the open sea are located on both sides of the islands, which will become inaccessible in the wake of so called "development" on the islands.

Moreover, they informed us that based on their reliable sources your ministry has not conducted an

We want to convey our serious concerns about the project and urge you to stop it immediately. We urge you to undertake an Environmental Impact Assessment of the project and consult with the affected persons of this development.

*Teodoro Anana
Assistant Coordinator -
Urban Poor Associates,
Quezon City, Philippines*



Fishing communities: Livelihoods at stake

KCR delayed as report on feasibility awaited

Daily DAWN 31 August, 2007

Despite the availability of the feasibility report, work on the planned revival of the Karachi circular railway has not kicked off since its revalidation report is yet to be received from the UK consultant M/s Scott Wilson.

The foreign consultant has to offer advice on how best to implement the project without unnecessarily inconveniencing commuters, and assess the minimum amount of land required.

You can't blame the CDGK for every problem: Kamal

The Daily Times 30 August, 2007

The city district government of Karachi (CDGK) or the city nazim cannot be held responsible for all the city's problems without first examining whether its is linked to them or not, said City Nazim Mustafa Kamal at the third Annual Consumer Choice Awards Wednesday.

Karachi is unique insofar as more than 13 stakeholders control it. They are supposed to provide citizens municipal services for which every one of them collects municipal taxes within their jurisdictions.

Gulshan Town to start traffic education programme

Daily Times, 1 Sept, 2007

Children should be educated about traffic laws, cleanliness and sanitation and classes should be held for this purpose with the cooperation of the traffic and sanitation staff, decided the members of a meeting chaired by Gulshan-e-Iqbal

Town Nazim Wasay Jalil on Friday. Jalil said that improved education standards could bring a positive change in society.

Boy scouts from educational institutions and other volunteers will be deployed during Ramadan for traffic control for which they will be paid honoraria by the Town.



NEIGHBOURHOOD WATCH

SHEHRI invites the residents of the city to share with us, their concerns, on issues which are adversely affecting their neighbourhood's environment. Please write to us, preferably with a supporting photograph, so that efforts are made and solutions sought - Ed.

CONVERSION MOST ILLEGAL!

(Construction of 3rd Floor, Plot 123-R, P.E.C.H.S, Block 2, Karachi

We the following signatories of street 122 and 123 request our respected Shehri Organization to take notice of the subject irregularity, and take necessary steps to protect the residents' rights in this respect.

The owner of the subject plot began construction at Plot - 123R, resulting in enough noise, dust and cement pollution into the street. We remained patient to afore-said problems in spirit of being good neighbors.

Completion of ground plus two floors seemed to be legal.

Whereas, now illegal 3rd Floor layout and erection of rooms partition walls and bath rooms just like 2nd floor plus reinforced pillars have been made, which seems to be illegal. Iron bars for the roof are being laid out for the roof.

The residents of the street can not afford additional load on water, electric, parking problems and other amenities. Therefore, we propose to nip the evil in the bud through our Shehri Organization to protect our rights. □

***Residents of Street No. 122-123,
Block-2, PECHS, Karachi***



URBAN PLANNING

An expressway to disaster

Arif Hasan expresses grave concerns over the adverse social, environmental impacts of the proposed 'Elevated Expressway Project' of the CDGK.

I, the undersigned, have the following comments to make concerning the EIA of the Karachi Elevated Expressway.

1. The EIA does not give the names, qualifications and experience of the consultants and/or the experts who have worked on the study. As such, one cannot judge the quality of the study. This is a very serious shortcoming of the EIA. Citizens should not only know who the consultants/experts are but at a public hearing they should be able to interact with them.
2. The EIA does not deal in statistical terms with the impact of the proposed road networks on the traffic patterns along the Shahrah-e-Faisal Corridor. These proposed road networks consist of three ring roads, signal-free radial roads, the Lyari Expressway and the Northern Bypass. In the absence of a study on the impact of the roads on Shahrah-e-Faisal, the analysis of traffic patterns on this corridor are not acceptable.
3. In many places in the EIA mentions that expressways in South-Asian cities have successfully solved transportation and vehicular movement

problems. However, this is not correct. A number of publications by the prestigious Indian

Institution of Technology, New Delhi, show that these solutions have been expensive, have caused considerable environmental and aesthetic degradation and have created immense problems for pedestrians and in addition have not solved the problems they set out to solve. For details, please refer to the book "Urban

Transport for Growing Cities" by Geetam Tiwari published by Macmillan India Limited, New Delhi, 2002.

4. Bangkok, Manila, Cairo and Tehran have also built many hundred kilometers of expressways through their city centres. These expressways have caused enormous environmental problems related to sound and air pollution, a denial of sun light, loss of

urban space and social alienation and problems for pedestrians. They have not solved

the traffic problems of these cities whose traffic congestion, in spite of these expressways, is far worse than that of Karachi.

5. It is universally accepted by transport engineers today that expressways should not be built through city centres as they create environmental, aesthetic and social problems. That

is why you do not find such expressways being built anymore through the city in the developed world. As a matter of fact cities like Seoul and Boston are busy demolishing their expressways and flyovers. A number of Latin American cities (such as Curitiba and Bogota) have solved their congestion problems without constructing elevated expressways through their cities. Do we have to fol-

It is universally accepted by transport engineers today that expressways should not be built through city centres as they create environmental, aesthetic and social problems. That is why you do not find such expressways being built anymore through the city in the developed world. As a matter of fact cities like Seoul and Boston are busy demolishing their expressways and flyovers.



low examples that have failed in other cities and are rejected by experts and transport related academia?

Super Highways. Do we have to have an elevated corridor on "strategic" roads? If so, why? Another similar corridor is the Mai Kolachi, Khyaban-

6. In the case of Riyadh, the expressway through the city was responsible for so much pollution that the authorities had to vacate the areas on either side of it and forest these areas. Therefore, it is difficult to believe that an expressway carrying port related traffic on Shahrah-e-Faisal will not cause air and noise related problems.

7. The fact that no scientific study has been carried out on the impact of traffic patterns on Shahrah-e-Faisal as a result of the proposed road network for Karachi, means that the decision to build the expressway is an ad-hoc one and not a part of a larger traffic and transportation plan for the city.

8. The EIA also states that the Shahrah-e-Faisal Corridor is a "strategic" one since it connects Jinnah Bridge to Port Qasim and the link road between the National and

Let us face it that the traffic congestion on Shahrah-e-Faisal Corridor is the result of non-existent traffic management, misuse of service lanes and the absence of car parking spaces (which can be organized if a proper commercialisation plan is put in place). The question is, if all this could be done what difference would it make? The EIA does not even attempt to answer this question.

e-Saadi, Sunset Boulevard, Korangi Road Corridor. Why do we not consider that as a "strategic" corridor?

9. Shahrah-e-Faisal Corridor beginning from PIDC upto the Drigh Road Station is an open urban space. The sky is visible above. There are service lanes and space for greenery. There is an immense potential for pedestrianisation and social activity. The area from PIDC to Napier Barracks contains important

hotels, museums, clubs and linkages with Saddar. This area again has the possibility of developing as a tourist area with linkages to the other potential cultural prescients of the city. The building of this expressway in those narrow medians will be a complete social and environmental disaster and will deny the city the possibility of developing this area as a tourist and cultural prescient.

10. If ad-hoc decisions have to be taken, then let them be decisions that do not cause such an enormous damage as the proposed expressway. In this connection, I suggest that the Jinnah Bridge, Mai Kolachi, Khyaban-e-Saadi, Sunset Boulevard, Korangi Road Corridor to Quaidabad should be developed as an alternative. The congestion along this corridor can be overcome easily by elevating the expressway between Submarine Chowrangi and South Circular Avenue and building flyovers wherever necessary to make the corridor signal-free.

11. Let us face it that the traffic congestion on Shahrah-e-Faisal Corridor is the result of non-existent traffic management, misuse of service lanes and the absence of car parking spaces (which can be organized if a proper commercialisation plan is put in place). The question is, if all this could be done what difference would it make? The EIA does not even attempt to answer this question.

12. It is my considered opinion that the proposed expressway, in addition to the points mentioned above, will be an eyesore and insult to the people of Karachi. □

Arif Hasan
is Chairman,
Urban Resource Centre



ASK SHEHRI

Most residents when faced with any civic problem do not know which person or organization to contact in order to solve their problem. In this column we invite the readers to share their worries with us and seek our help, which is always forthcoming - Ed.

Ask Shehri

Q. When was the KW&SB established?

Adil Mehdi, Gulbarg, Karachi

A. In 1981, the Karachi Water Management Board (KWMB) was created and assigned responsibility for water distribution throughout the metropolitan area and was given enhanced powers of cost recovery. Subsequently, the GoS enacted the Sindh Local Government (Amendment) Ordinance of January 1983 leading to creation, within KMC, of the Karachi Water and Sewerage Board (KW&SB). The KW&SB was assigned to handle the water supply and sanitation services in Karachi.

Q. How much water is supplied to Karachi by KW&SB?

Qasim Murad, Gadap, Karachi

A. 630 MGD

Q. How much waste water is generated in Karachi?

Saba Mujahid, North Nazimabad, Karachi

A. 450 MGD

**Shehri
needs volunteers
be an
environmental activist
work with an
experienced team**

Shehri Committees

Legal

Media & Outreach

Anti-Pollution

Parks & Recreation

Gun Free Society

Conservation & Heritage

Fund Raiser



JOIN SHEHRI

To Create a Better Environment

If you wish to join
shehri please send
this card to

SHEHRI Citizens for a Better
Environment
206-G, Block 2, P.E.C.H.S.,
Karachi-75400, Pakistan
Tel / Fax : 453-0646

With a cross cheque of Rs. 1000/- (Annual Membership Fee)
in the name of Shehri-CBE with passport size photograph

Name : _____

Tel. (Off) : _____ Tel. (Res) : _____

Address : _____

Occupation _____

SHEHRI MEMBERSHIP

Don't forget to renew your
membership for 2007! (Rs. 1000)
Join Shehri and do your bit as a
good citizen to make this city a
clean, healthy and environmentally
friendly place to live in!



DEVELOPMENT

OPP: Squatters show the way to better sanitation

Zofeen T. Ebrahim analyzes the role OPP has played in directing slum improvement initiatives in Pakistan and questions the future role of OPP in the development dynamic of the country.

Mohammad Shamsuddin, still grimaces when he recalls the "swarming flies and mosquitoes, over-flowing soak-pits, bucket latrines and the sludge and the sewage" as also the quarrels in Orangi as to whose rubbish and waste was causing the foul smell.

He also remembers the time when life began to take a turn for the better, when the primitive sanitation system was replaced by a fully functioning one, that too, at a price affordable for all. But like so many others living in his lane he proudly claims to have literally lend a hand building the drains and the sewers.

Orangi, one of the biggest of Karachi's 539 squatter settlements--built through the illegal occupation and subdivision of state land--was once a stinking township with a primitive, almost non-existent sanitation system.

Substandard housing, open sewers and alleys filled with garbage and human ordure, Orangi was once considered an eyesore by officials. Today, almost 25 years later, they show-case it as a success story to local and foreign urban planners, donor agencies, non-government organisations (NGOs) working in water supply and sanitation, and even anthropologists.

The transformation of Orangi can be attributed to a vibrant, three-way partnership among community, civil society and state, based on the philosophy of the late Akhtar Hameed Khan, the founder of the Orangi Pilot Project and training Institute (OPP-RTI).

Back in 1980, Dr Khan set up the Orangi Pilot Project Research and



Clean water for all: A goal we all must share in achieving

Training Institute (OPP-RTI), as an NGO to help mobilise and organise 'katchi abadis' or low-income settlements and enable them to find their own alternatives in accessing municipal services, housing, health care, education and employment.

Arif Hasan, a renowned urban planner and architect, says: "Such cost-effective initiatives to improve and extend provisions for services to low-income urban households have considerable relevance for meeting the health, education, women's empowerment and environmental targets within the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) and OPP-RTI is a precious example of this".

According to a survey conducted by the World Health Organisation (WHO) and the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) last year, Pakistan is well on track to achieving assigned targets by the MDGs evolved during a UN summit in 2000.

Under the MDGs world communities must reduce by half the proportion of people without access to safe drinking water and basic sanitation 2015, with

1990 taken as the base year when some 23 per cent of the world's population of 5.3 billion people lacked access to safe drinking water sources and 51 per cent did not have access to improved sanitation facilities.

Pakistan's coverage of drinking water was far better than its rate of improvement in sanitation facilities although the Orangi example stands out like beacon.

"It clearly shows how to reach even the poorest households in the urban areas. Also, that it costs far less than what it would cost the government or private contractors," Hasan said, adding that, ideally, an equal partnership has to be maintained between community and government.

Explaining the low-cost sanitation programme, Perween Rehman, director of OPP-RTI director, said that they started by advocating for the development of an underground sewerage system, one lane at a time, without a master plan, on the one hand, and convincing the local government to "build and improve on existing external drainage system of the rest of Karachi

which would cost less than starting a new system".

And that is where they sought support from people like Shamsuddin, a community activist. "We were requested to form tanzeems (organised groups). I remember we'd hold countless meetings that would continue well into late evenings. Each lane consisting of 20-30 houses was made the unit of organisation," recalls Shamsuddin as he rolls out the dog-eared and yellowed survey maps of his area.

"It was not easy convincing people that they would have to take it upon themselves to set up a sanitation system, and pay for it too, as the local government may take forever to do so if we waited". People had to be told that poor sanitation is the root cause of health problems and that in turn was a major cause or contributor to their poverty.

Once the mind-sets changed, working with the community became easy.

Each lane was asked to nominate a lane manager who applies to the OPP-RTI for technical assistance and managerial guidance. The latter would survey the lane, prepare a sanitation-engineering plan and estimates and hand the data to the lane manager. The manager would then collect the money and begin work.

It costs a household, on an average, 16 US dollars to contribute towards the underground sewerage line and a sanitary latrine. This development is called 'internal' development by Rehman who says similar improvements done by the city government would cost five times more.

To date, Orangi residents have installed sewers in 5,394 lanes, serving 80,910 of the 94,122 houses.

The 'external' development, consisted of trunk sewers, treatment plants and long secondary sewers that cannot be done by the community. That, she

said, remains the task of the state.

Years of tireless work has now been compiled in a thick, priced publication, full of survey maps, painstakingly marking each and every drain of the area surveyed so far. Last year, the Works and Services department of the city government requested OPP-RTI to assist it in the development of natural drainage channels--around 40--all over Karachi.

And they have already completed survey maps of 21 main drains. They have also documented 332 of the 539 katchi abadis in Karachi along with physical and economic proposals for upgrading the nallas (natural drains) of Karachi through which most of city's sewage flows.

"Our basic focus still remains benefit to the poor, whether we work in katchi abadis or elsewhere in the city," adds Rehman.

"They are very rich in their data bank when it comes to sewerage, drainage and sanitation issues," says Shoaib Siddiqui, former executive district officer in the city government, in charge of the 500 million U.S. dollar mega project called 'Tameer-e-Karachi Programme, 2003-04'.

"They had to spread to the city as the katchi abadis' sewage disposal system was linked to the rest of Karachi," said Siddiqui.

"I'd call it a success story," says Nasir Abbas, Director General of Sindh Katchi Abadis' Authority, echoing Siddiqui's sentiments. "The idea has spread because it is so economically sound. Being an incremental project, they started from a micro level and grew to encompass the macro level, it was a slow process".



Self help initiatives need to be promoted

But there are urban planners who are a little wary of OPP-RTI's expertise in design. "OPP presently does not possess such capacity. The government, think, has both the experts and the experience for managing projects. For implementation, there are some very good local engineering firms that can help out," says Farhan Anwar, an urban planner.

Even Shoaib Bokhari, Provincial Minister for Planning and Development (Sindh), is not too convinced. "I believe in OPP's sincerity but I don't believe they have the expertise or the capacity to do everything".

Nonetheless, there must be something outstanding about this model for which else would it be replicated outside Karachi in 13 other cities and towns.

Even the World Bank has accepted the model for replication in 100 villages in the Punjab province. The OPP-RTI model has also influenced programmes in South Africa, Central Asia, Nepal and Sri Lanka. □

Courtesy: IPP

Zofeen T. Ebrahim is a Freelance Journalist specializing in urban development issues.